

In the  
Supreme Court of Ohio

LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF OHIO, et al., :  
: *Relators*, : Case No. 2021-1193  
: *v.* : Original Action Pursuant to  
: Ohio Const., Art. XI  
OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, et al., :  
: *Respondents.* : Apportionment Case  
:

---

BRIA BENNETT, et al., :  
: *Relators*, : Case No. 2021-1198  
: *v.* : Original Action Pursuant to  
: Ohio Const., Art. XI  
OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, et al., :  
: *Respondents.* : Apportionment Case  
:

---

OHIO ORGANIZING COLLABORATIVE, et al., :  
: *Relators*, : Case No. 2021-1210  
: *v.* : Original Action Pursuant to  
: Ohio Const., Art. XI  
OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, et al., :  
: *Respondents.* : Apportionment Case  
:

---

SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF OF GOVERNOR MIKE DEWINE, SECRETARY OF STATE  
FRANK LAROSE, AND AUDITOR KEITH FABER

---

OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

BRIDGET C. COONTZ (0072919)

*Counsel of Record*

JULIE M. PFEIFFER (0069762)

MICHAEL A. WALTON (0092201)

Assistant Attorneys General

MICHAEL J. HENDERSHOT (0081842)

Deputy Solicitor

Constitutional Offices Section

30 E. Broad Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Tel: 614-466-2872 | Fax: 614-728-7592

Bridget.Coontz@OhioAGO.gov

Julie.Pfeiffer@OhioAGO.gov

Michael.Walton@OhioAGO.gov

Michael.Hendershot@OhioAGO.gov

*Counsel for Respondents Ohio Governor DeWine,  
Ohio Secretary of State LaRose, and Ohio Auditor  
Faber*

LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF OHIO, et al., :  
:  
*Relators,* : **Case No. 2021-1193**  
:  
v. : **Original Action Pursuant to**  
: **Ohio Const., Art. XI**  
OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, et al., :  
: **Apportionment Case**  
*Respondents.* :

---

### COUNSEL FOR RELATORS

*\*Not admitted in Ohio*

FREDA J. LEVENSON (0045916)  
ACLU of Ohio Foundation, Inc.  
4506 Chester Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44103  
Tel: 614-586-1972 x 125  
flevenson@acluohio.org

DAVID J. CAREY (0088787)  
ACLU of Ohio Foundation, Inc.  
1108 City Park Avenue, Suite 203  
Columbus, OH 43206  
(614) 586-1972 x2004  
dcarey@acluohio.org

ALORA THOMAS\*  
KELSEY MILLER\*  
JULIE A. EBENSTEIN\*  
American Civil Liberties Union  
125 Broad Street  
New York, NY 10004  
(212) 519-7866  
athomas@aclu.org  
jebenstein@aclu.org

ROBERT D. FRAM (PHV-25414)  
DONALD BROWN\*  
JOSHUA GONZÁLEZ (PHV-25424)  
JULIANA GOLDROSEN (PHV-25193)  
DAVID DENUYL (PHV-25452)  
Covington & Burling LLP  
Salesforce Tower  
415 Mission Street, Suite 5400  
San Francisco, CA 94105-2533  
(415) 591 6000  
rfram@cov.com

LAURA B BENDER (PHV-25192)  
Covington & Burling LLP  
MEGAN KEENAN (PHV-25410)  
Alexander Thomson (PHV-25462)  
850 W. Tenth Street, NW  
Washington DC 20001-4956  
Tel: (202) 662-5968  
Fax: (202) 662-6291  
bbender@cov.com  
mkeenan@cov.com  
athomson@cov.com

YIYE FU (PHV-25419)  
Covington & Burling LLP  
JAMES HOVARD (PHV-25420)  
ANUPAM SHARMA (PHV-25418)  
3000 El Camino Real  
5 Palo Alto Square  
Palo Alto CA 94306-2112  
Tel: (650) 632-4716  
Fax: (650) 632-4800  
yfu@cov.com  
jhovard@cov.com  
asharma@cov.com

MADISON ARENT  
Covington & Burling LLP  
The New York Times Building  
620 Eighth Avenue  
New York, NY 10018-1405  
Tel: (212) 841 1000  
marent@cov.co

**COUNSEL FOR AMICUS CURIAE  
CAMPAIGN LEGAL CENTER**

STEVEN S. KAUFMAN (0016662)  
DOLORES P. GARCIA PRIGNITZ  
(0085644)  
SARA S. DORLAND (0095682)  
Ulmer & Berne  
1100 Skylight Office Tower  
1660 West Second Street  
Cleveland, Ohio 44113  
Tel: (216) 583-7000  
Fax: (216) 583-7001  
skaufman@ulmer.com  
dgarcia@ulmer.com  
sdorland@ulmer.com

ROBERT N. WEINER  
(PHV 25521 pending)  
CHRISTOPHER LAMAR  
(PHV 25519 pending)  
VALENCIA RICHARDSON  
(PHV 25517 pending)  
Campaign Legal Center  
1101 14th Street NW, Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20005  
Tel: (202) 736-2200  
Fax: (202) 736-2222  
rweiner@campaignlegalcenter.org  
clamar@campaignlegalcenter.org  
vrichardson@campaignlegalcenter.org

**COUNSEL FOR AMICUS CURIAE  
CITY OF CINCINNATI**

EMILY SMART WOERNER, (0089349)  
Deputy City Solicitor  
*Counsel of Record*  
SHANNON PRICE (100744)  
Assistant City Solicitor  
801 Plum Street, Room 214  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  
Tel: (513) 352-3309  
Fax: (513) 352-1515  
emily.woerner@cincinnati-oh.gov  
shannon.price@cincinnati-oh.gov

**COUNSEL FOR AMICUS CURIAE WE  
ARE OHIO**

JOHN M. HASELEY (0063042)  
470 West Broad Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Tel: (614) 937-8872  
haseley@goconnorlaw.com

**COUNSEL FOR AMICUS CURIAE  
OHIO STATE CONFERENCE OF THE  
NAACP**

\*Not admitted to Ohio Bar

SUBODH CHANDRA (0069233)  
DONALD SCREEN (0044070)

*Counsel of Record*

The Chandra Law Firm LLC

1265 West 6th Street

Cleveland, Ohio 44113

Tel: (216) 578-1700

subodh.chandra@chandralaw.com

donald.screen@chandralaw.com

JANETTE MCCARTHY WALLACE  
(0066257)

ANTHONY P. ASHTON\*

ANNA KATHRYN BARNES\*

NAACP

Office of the General Counsel

4805 Mount Hope Drive

Baltimore, MD 21215

Tel: (410) 580-577

jlouard@naacpnet.org

aashton@naacpnet.org

abarnes@naacpnet.org

JON GREENBAUM\*

EZRA ROSENBERG\*

POOJA CHAUDHURI\*

Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights  
Under Law

1500 K Street, N.W., Ste. 900

Washington, D.C. 20005

Tel: (202) 662-8600

jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org

erosenberg@lawyerscommittee.org

pchaudhuri@lawyerscommittee.org

**COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENTS SEN-  
ATE PRESIDENT MATT HUFFMAN  
AND HOUSE SPEAKER ROBERT  
CUPP**

PHILLIP J. STRACH (PHV-25444)

THOMAS A. FARR (PHV-25461)

JOHN E. BRANCH, III (PHV-25460)

ALYSSA M. RIGGINS (PHV-25441)

GREG MCGUIRE (PHV-25483)

Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough  
LLP

4140 Parklake Ave., Suite 200

Raleigh, North Carolina 27612

Tel: (919) 329-3812

phil.strach@nelsonmullins.com

tom.farr@nelsonmullins.com

john.branch@nelsonmullins.com

alyssa.riggins@nelsonmullins.com

greg.mcguire@nelsonmullins.com

W. STUART DORNETTE (0002955)

BETH A. BRYAN (0082076)

PHILIP D. WILLIAMSON (0097174)

Taft Stettinus & Hollister LLP

425 Walnut St., Suite 1800

Cincinnati, OH 45202-3957

Tel: 513-381-2838

dornette@taftlaw.com

bryan@taftlaw.com

pwilliamson@taftlaw.com

**COUNSEL FOR AMICUS CURIAE  
DAVID NIVEN, Ph.D.**

STEPHANIE M. CHMIEL (0087555)

*Counsel of Record*

MARY E. CSARNY (0097682)

Thompson Hine LLP

41 S. High Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215

Tel: (614) 469-3247

Fax: (614) 469-3361

Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com

Mary.Csarny@ThompsonHine.com

**COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENTS SEN-  
ATOR VERNON SYKES AND  
HOUSE MINORITY LEADER EMILIA  
SYKES**

JOHN GILLIGAN (0024542)

DIANE MENASHE (0070305)

Ice Miller LLP

250 West Street, Suite 700

Columbus, Ohio 43215

John.Gilligan@icemiller.com

Diane.Menashe@icemiller.com

**COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENT  
OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMIS-  
SION SPECIAL COUNSEL TO AT-  
TORNEY GENERAL DAVE YOST**

ERIK J. CLARK (0078732)

ASHLEY MERINO (0096853)

Organ Law LLP

1330 Dublin Road

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Tel: (614) 481-0900

Fax: (614) 481-0904

ejclark@organlegal.com

amerino@organlegal.com

**BRIA BENNETT, et al.,**

*Relators,*

v.

**OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, et al.,**

*Respondents.*

:  
:  
: **Case No. 2021-1198**  
:  
: **Original Action Pursuant to**  
: **Ohio Const., Art. XI**  
:  
: **Apportionment Case**  
:

---

**COUNSEL FOR RELATORS**

DONALD J. MCTIGUE (0022849)

*Counsel of Record*

DEREK S. CLINGER (0092075)

McTigue & Colombo LLC

dmctigue@electionlawgroup.com

dclinger@electionlawgroup.com

ABHA KHANNA (PHV-2189)

WILLIAM B. STAFFORD (PHV-25433)

Elias Law Group

1700 Seventh Ave., Suite 2100

Seattle, WA 98101

Tel: (206) 656-0716

akhanna@elias.law

bstafford@elias.law

ARIA C. BRANCH (PHV-25435)

JYOTI JASRASARIA (PHV-25401)

SPENCER W. KLEIN (PHV-25432)

Elias Law Group

10 G Street NC, Suite 600

Washington, DC 20002

Telephone: 202-968-449

abranach@elias.law

jjasrasaria@elias.law

sklein@elias.law

**COUNSEL FOR AMICUS CURIAE**

**CITY OF CINCINNATI**

EMILY SMART WOERNER, (0089349)

Deputy City Solicitor

*Counsel of Record*

SHANNON PRICE (100744)

Assistant City Solicitor

801 Plum Street, Room 214

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Tel: (513) 352-3309

Fax: (513) 352-1515

emily.woerner@cincinnati-oh.gov

shannon.price@cincinnati-oh.gov

**COUNSEL FOR AMICUS CURIAE**

**DAVID NIVEN, Ph.D.**

STEPHANIE M. CHMIEL (0087555)

*Counsel of Record*

MARY E. CSARNY (0097682)

Thompson Hine LLP

41 S. High Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215

Tel: (614) 469-3247

Fax: (614) 469-3361

Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com  
Mary.Csarny@ThompsonHine.com  
**COUNSEL FOR LEAGUE OF  
WOMEN VOTERS**

FREDA J. LEVENSON (0045916)  
ACLU of Ohio Foundation, Inc.  
4506 Chester Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44103  
(614) 586-1972 x125  
flevenson@acluohio.org

DAVID J. CAREY (0088787)  
ACLU of Ohio Foundation, Inc.  
1108 City Park Avenue, Suite 203  
Columbus, OH 43206  
(614) 586-1972 x2004  
dcarey@acluohio.org

**COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENTS SEN-  
ATE PRESIDENT MATT HUFFMAN  
AND HOUSE SPEAKER ROBERT  
CUPP**

PHILLIP J. STRACH (PHV-25444)  
THOMAS A. FARR (PHV-25461)  
JOHN E. BRANCH, III (PHV-25460)  
ALYSSA M. RIGGINS (PHV-25441)  
GREG McGUIRE (PHV-25483)  
Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough  
LLP  
4140 Parklake Ave., Suite 200  
Raleigh, North Carolina 27612  
Tel: (919) 329-3812  
phil.strach@nelsonmullins.com  
tom.farr@nelsonmullins.com  
john.branch@nelsonmullins.com  
alyssa.riggins@nelsonmullins.com  
greg.mcguire@nelsonmullins.com

W. STUART DORNETTE (0002955)  
BETH A. BRYAN (0082076)  
PHILIP D. WILLIAMSON (0097174)  
Taft Stettinus & Hollister LLP  
425 Walnut St., Suite 1800  
Cincinnati, OH 45202-3957  
Tel: 513-381-2838  
dornette@taftlaw.com  
bryan@taftlaw.com  
pwilliamson@taftlaw.com

**COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENTS SEN-  
ATOR VERNON SYKES AND HOUSE  
MINORITY LEADER EMILIA SYKES**

JOHN GILLIGAN (0024542)  
DIANE MENASHE (0070305)  
Ice Miller LLP  
250 West Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
John.Gilligan@icemiller.com  
Diane.Menashe@icemiller.com

**COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENT  
OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMIS-  
SION SPECIAL COUNSEL TO  
ATTORNEY GENERAL DAVE YOST**

ERIK J. CLARK (0078732)  
ASHLEY MERINO (0096853)  
Organ Law LLP  
1330 Dublin Road  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Tel: (614) 481-0900  
Fax: (614) 481-0904  
ejclark@organlegal.com  
amerino@organlegal.com



OHIO ORGANIZING COLLABORATIVE, et al., :  
:  
*Relators,* : **Case No. 2021-1210**  
:  
v. : **Original Action Pursuant to**  
: **Ohio Const., Art. XI**  
OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, et al., :  
: **Apportionment Case**  
*Respondents.* :

---

**COUNSEL FOR RELATORS**

ALICIA L. BANNON  
(PHV 25409-2021)  
YURIJ RUDENSKY (PHV 25422-2021)  
MICHAEL LI (PHV 25430-2021)\*  
ETHAN HERENSTEIN  
(PHV 25429-2021)  
Brennan Center For Justice  
at NYU School Of Law  
120 Broadway, Suite 1750  
New York, NY 10271  
Tel: (646) 292-8310  
Fax: (212) 463-7308  
alicia.bannon@nyu.edu

PETER M. ELLIS (0070264)

*Counsel of Record*

M. PATRICK YINGLING  
(PHV 10145-2021)  
NATALIE R. SALAZAR  
REED SMITH LLP  
10 South Wacker Drive, 40th Floor  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Tel: (312) 207-1000  
Fax: (312) 207-6400  
pellis@reedsmith.com

BEN R. FLIEGEL (PHV 25411-2021)  
Reed Smith LLP  
355 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2900  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Tel: (213) 457-8000  
Fax: (213) 457-8080  
bfliegel@reedsmith.com

BRAD A. FUNARI (PHV 3139-2021)  
DANIELLE L. STEWART (0084086)  
Reed Smith Centre  
Reed Smith LLP  
225 Fifth Avenue  
Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
Tel: (412) 288-4583  
Fax: (412) 288-3063  
bfunari@reedsmith.com  
dstewart@reedsmith.com

BRIAN A. SUTHERLAND  
(PHV 25406-2021)  
Reed Smith LLP  
101 Second Street, Suite 1800  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Tel: (415) 543-8700  
Fax: (415) 391-8269  
bsutherland@reedsmith.com

**COUNSEL FOR AMICUS CURIAE  
CITY OF CINCINNATI**

EMILY SMART WOERNER, (0089349)

Deputy City Solicitor

*Counsel of Record*

SHANNON PRICE (100744)

Assistant City Solicitor

801 Plum Street, Room 214

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Tel: (513) 352-3309

Fax: (513) 352-1515

emily.woerner@cincinnati-oh.gov

shannon.price@cincinnati-oh.gov

**COUNSEL FOR AMICUS CURIAE  
DAVID NIVEN, Ph.D.**

STEPHANIE M. CHMIEL (0087555)

*Counsel of Record*

MARY E. CSARNY (0097682)

Thompson Hine LLP

41 S. High Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215

Tel: (614) 469-3247

Fax: (614) 469-3361

Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com

Mary.Csarny@ThompsonHine.com

**COUNSEL FOR LEAGUE OF  
WOMEN VOTERS**

FREDA J. LEVENSON (0045916)

ACLU of Ohio Foundation, Inc.

4506 Chester Avenue

Cleveland, Ohio 44103

Tel: (614) 586-1972, x125

flevenson@acluohio.org

**COUNSEL FOR AMICUS CURIAE  
OHIO STATE CONFERENCE OF THE  
NAACP**

**\*Not admitted to Ohio Bar**

SUBODH CHANDRA (0069233)

DONALD SCREEN (0044070)

*Counsel of Record*

The Chandra Law Firm LLC

1265 West 6th Street

Cleveland, Ohio 44113

Tel: (216) 578-1700

subodh.chandra@chandralaw.com

donald.screen@chandralaw.com

JANETTE MCCARTHY WALLACE  
(0066257)

ANTHONY P. ASHTON\*

ANNA KATHRYN BARNES\*

NAACP

Office of the General Counsel

4805 Mount Hope Drive

Baltimore, MD 21215

Tel: (410) 580-577

jlouard@naacpnet.org

aashton@naacpnet.org

abarnes@naacpnet.org

JON GREENBAUM\*

EZRA ROSENBERG\*

POOJA CHAUDHURI\*

Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights  
Under Law

1500 K Street, N.W., Ste. 900

Washington, D.C. 20005

Tel: (202) 662-8600

jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org

erosenberg@lawyerscommittee.org

pchaudhuri@lawyerscommittee.org

**COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENTS SEN-  
ATE PRESIDENT MATT HUFFMAN  
AND HOUSE SPEAKER ROBERT  
CUPP**

PHILLIP J. STRACH (PHV-25444)  
THOMAS A. FARR (PHV-25461)  
JOHN E. BRANCH, III (PHV-25460)  
ALYSSA M. RIGGINS (PHV-25441)  
GREG MCGUIRE (PHV-25483)  
Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough  
LLP  
4140 Parklake Ave., Suite 200  
Raleigh, North Carolina 27612  
Tel: (919) 329-3812  
phil.strach@nelsonmullins.com  
tom.farr@nelsonmullins.com  
john.branch@nelsonmullins.com  
alyssa.riggins@nelsonmullins.com  
greg.mcguire@nelsonmullins.com

W. STUART DORNETTE (0002955)  
BETH A. BRYAN (0082076)  
PHILIP D. WILLIAMSON (0097174)  
Taft Stettinus & Hollister LLP  
425 Walnut St., Suite 1800  
Cincinnati, OH 45202-3957  
Tel: 513-381-2838  
dornette@taftlaw.com  
bryan@taftlaw.com  
pwilliamson@taftlaw.com

**COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENTS SEN-  
ATOR VERNON SYKES AND  
HOUSE MINORITY LEADER EMILIA  
SYKES**

JOHN GILLIGAN (0024542)  
DIANE MENASHE (0070305)  
Ice Miller LLP  
250 West Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
John.Gilligan@icemiller.com  
Diane.Menashe@icemiller.com

**COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENT  
OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMIS-  
SION  
SPECIAL COUNSEL TO ATTORNEY  
GENERAL DAVE YOST**

ERIK J. CLARK (0078732)  
ASHLEY MERINO (0096853)  
Organ Law LLP  
1330 Dublin Road  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Tel: (614) 481-0900  
Fax: (614) 481-0904  
ejclark@organlegal.com  
amerino@organlegal.com

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                              |    |
|------------------------------|----|
| Table of Authorities .....   | ii |
| Argument .....               | 1  |
| Conclusion .....             | 5  |
| Certificate Of Service ..... | 7  |

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

| <b>Cases</b>   | <b>Page(s)</b> |
|--|----------------|
| <i>Athens v. McClain</i> ,<br>163 Ohio St. 3d 61, 2020-Ohio-5146, 168 N.E.3d 411 .....                                 | 3              |
| <i>Ayers v. City of Cleveland</i> ,<br>160 Ohio St. 3d 288, 2020-Ohio-1047, 156 N.E.3d 8483 .....                      | 3              |
| <i>Hill v. Higdon</i> ,<br>5 Ohio St. 243 (1855).....  | 4              |
| <i>Loughrin v. United States</i> ,<br>573 U.S. 351 (2014).....   | 3              |
| <i>Miracle v. Ohio Dep’t of Veterans Servs.</i> ,<br>157 Ohio St. 3d 413, 2019-Ohio-3308, 137 N.E.3d 1110 .....        | 3              |
| <i>Smith v. Leis</i> ,<br>106 Ohio St. 3d 309, 2005-Ohio-5125, 835 N.E.2d 5 .....                                      | 4              |
| <i>State v. Bryant</i> ,<br>160 Ohio St. 3d 113, 2020-Ohio-1041, 154 N.E.3d 31 .....                                   | 3, 4           |
| <i>State v. Jones</i> ,<br>163 Ohio St. 3d 242, 2020-Ohio-6729, 169 N.E.3d 649 .....                                   | 3              |
| <i>State v. Noling</i> ,<br>153 Ohio St. 3d 108, 2018-Ohio-795, 101 N.E.3d 435 .....                                   | 3              |
| <i>State v. Porterfield</i> ,<br>106 Ohio St. 3d 5, 2005-Ohio-3095, 829 N.E.2d 690 .....                               | 4              |
| <i>State ex rel. Toledo v. Lucas Cty. Bd. of Elections</i> ,<br>95 Ohio St.3d 73, 2002-Ohio-1383, 765 N.E.2d 854 ..... | 3, 4           |
| <b>Other Authorities</b>   | <b>Page(s)</b> |
| Ohio Const., Art. XI, § 3 .....  | 1              |
| Ohio Const., Art. XI, § 6 .....  | 1, 4           |
| Ohio Const., Art. XI, § 8 .....  | 3              |

Ohio Const., Art. XI, § 8(B) .....2

Ohio Const., Art. XI, § 8(C).....2, 3

**Other Authorities** **Page(s)**

Ohio Const., Art. XI, § 8(C)(1) .....1, 3, 4

Ohio Const., Art. XI, § 8(C)(1)(a) .....1, 2, 3

Ohio Const., Art. XI, § 8(C)(1)(b) .....2, 3

Ohio Const., Art. XI, § 9 .....1, 2, 3, 4

Ohio Const., Art. XI, § 9(D)(3).....1, 4

Ohio Const., Art. XI, §9(D)(3)(c) .....1, 3, 4

## ARGUMENT

Ultimately, Article XI, Section 8(C)(1), does not impede this Court's "authority" to grant the relief requested in these cases. Rather, that section creates a 4-year/6 year map framework that would control elections for a decade when the Redistricting Commission does not adopt a ten-year map framework under Section 8(B). Both frameworks are subject to judicial review. Sections 8 and 9 need to be read together to discern the Court's "authority," as well as give full effect to all the language in Article XI. Specifically, Section 9(D)(3), which outlines the available remedies refers throughout to "the plan" or "a general assembly district plan" without mentioning the plan's duration.

But the reason that Section 8(C)(1) does not impede this Court's review authority underscores why Section 9(D)(3)(c) precludes the kind of claim alleged here, i.e., one that pleads no violation of Sections 2, 3, 4, 5, or 7, and instead pleads only a Section 6 violation. *See, e.g.,* Br. of Governor, et al., at 17–24. (The claims of Relators who allege violations under Section 3 fail for other reasons, *see id.* at 24–29, 35–36.) The Court's order to focus on Section 8(C)(1) highlights the importance of Section 9(D)(3)'s carefully tailored remedies. Without the specific language in Section 9(D)(3), the Court would lack authority to invalidate a map drawn under Section 8(C)(1)(a) at all. Read alone, Section 8(C)(1) *could* be read to support an argument that judicial review of four year maps is unavailable by parsing the differing language in 8(C)(1)(a) and (b). But that parsing would yield the surprising result that only six-year and ten-year maps are subject to judicial review.

At first glance, Section 8(C)(1)(a) precludes judicial remedies for four-year maps. That is because it makes no reference to Section 9's remedies, even though neighboring provisions explicitly cite Section 9. Section 8(C)(1)(a) addresses maps passed by "simple majority" vote. It provides that such maps last four years. That provision reads:

Except as otherwise provided in division (C)(1)(b) of this section, if the commission adopts a final general assembly district plan in accordance with division (A)(3) of this section by a simple majority vote of the commission, and not by the vote required to adopt a plan under division (B)(3) of Section 1 of this article, the plan shall take effect upon filing with the secretary of state and shall remain effective until two general elections for the house of representatives have occurred under the plan.

The very next provision is 8(C)(1)(b). It deals with maps passed by a simple majority that are necessary because the predecessor map lasted only four years. Such maps remain in effect for up to six years unless invalidated "as provided in Section 9." The full provision reads:

If the commission adopts a final general assembly district plan in accordance with division (A)(3) of this section by a simple majority vote of the commission, and not by the vote required to adopt a plan under division (B) of Section 1 of this article, and that plan is adopted to replace a plan that ceased to be effective under division (C)(1)(a) of this section before a year ending in the numeral one, the plan adopted under this division shall take effect upon filing with the secretary of state and shall remain effective until a year ending in the numeral one, except as provided in Section 9 of this article.

The section immediately before 8(C)(1)(a) deals with ten-year maps and also employs the "except as provided in Section 9" language as a carve-out to those map's default longevity. Ohio Const. Art. XI, §8(B).



Without looking outside Section 8(C), the difference in language between Sections 8(B) and 8(C)(1)(b) on one hand and Section 8(C)(1)(a) on the other would require giving the different provisions different meanings. That is because the Court generally interprets the Constitution by using “the same rules of construction” used “in construing statutes.” *Athens v. McClain*, 163 Ohio St. 3d 61, 2020-Ohio-5146, 168 N.E.3d 411, ¶ 29, quoting *Toledo City School Dist. Bd. of Edn. v. State Bd. of Edn.*, 146 Ohio St. 3d 356, 2016-Ohio-2806, 56 N.E.3d 950, ¶ 16. The basic rule for statutes and Constitutions alike is that different language conveys different meaning. That rule is strongest when a law “includes particular language in one section ... but omits it in another.” *Loughrin v. United States*, 573 U.S. 351, 358 (2014) (internal quotation marks omitted); see also *State v. Bryant*, 160 Ohio St. 3d 113, 2020-Ohio-1041, 154 N.E.3d 31, ¶ 18. So the absence of a reference to the Section 9 remedies for four-year maps is best read “to impose different legal standards” in these neighboring parts of the Constitution. *Miracle v. Ohio Dep’t of Veterans Servs.*, 157 Ohio St. 3d 413, 2019-Ohio-3308, 137 N.E.3d 1110, ¶ 19; see also *State v. Jones*, 163 Ohio St. 3d 242, 2020-Ohio-6729, 169 N.E.3d 649, ¶¶ 28, 31; *State v. Noling*, 153 Ohio St. 3d 108, 2018-Ohio-795, 101 N.E.3d 435, ¶ 42. In other words, because Division (C)(1)(a) omits what Division (C)(1)(b) and Section (B) include, the meaning of (C)(1)(a) is “underscored by what the [Constitution] does not say.” *Ayers v. City of Cleveland*, 160 Ohio St. 3d 288, 2020-Ohio-1047, 156 N.E.3d 848, ¶ 21. And what the Constitution conspicuously does not say is that a four-year map enacted under Section 8(C)(1)(a) can be invalidated

pursuant to Section 9. That is, Section 8(C)(1)(a) “could have” included Section 9 remedies, but the drafters of the provision “chose not to” include them. *Bryant* at ¶ 18. If we stopped there, Section 8(C)(1)(a) would be best read to afford no judicial review of maps passed under its authority. In other words, reading Section 8(C) alone would mean that the only remedies available against four-year maps would be political.

But Section 8(C)(1) is not an island. The Constitution, “like any document, is designed to be understood as a whole.” *State v. Porterfield*, 106 Ohio St. 3d 5, 2005-Ohio-3095, 829 N.E.2d 690, ¶ 12. So understanding Section 8(C) means reading it along with Section 9(D)(3)(c). And that Section explicitly contemplates this Court’s review of maps enacted under Section 8(C). So any lesson from reading 8(C) alone must be tempered with this explicit language in Section 9(D)(3)(c) that speaks to this Court’s review of Section 8(C) maps.

“Where provisions of the Constitution address the same subject matter, they must be read *in pari materia* and harmonized if possible.” *State ex rel. Toledo v. Lucas Cty. Bd. of Elections*, 95 Ohio St.3d 73, 78, 2002-Ohio-1383, 765 N.E.2d 854 (internal quotation marks omitted). Reading different parts of the Constitution together triggers a “duty to give a construction to the Constitution as will make it consistent with itself, and will harmonize and give effect to all its various provisions.” *Hill v. Higdon*, 5 Ohio St. 243, 247 (1855); *Smith v. Leis*, 106 Ohio St. 3d 309, 2005-Ohio-5125, 835 N.E.2d 5, ¶ 59.

Reading Sections 8 and 9 together requires a reading of Section 8 that preserves this Court’s review of maps “under Division (C) of Section 8.” Ohio Const., Art. XI, §9(D)(3)(c); *see also id.* §9(D)(3) (imposing required predicate violation of Sections 2, 3, 4, 5, or 7 for such review). And that means reading Section 8(C)(1)(a)’s “except as otherwise provided in division (C)(1)(b)” clause to incorporate into Section 8(C)(1)(a) the Section 9 reference in Section 8(C)(1)(b). Read that way, even maps passed under Section 8(C)(1)(a) are reviewable under Section 9(D)(3)(c).

This tour through Sections 8 and 9 underscores a point the Statewide officeholders made in their opening brief: allegations that a map violates the standards in Article XI, Section 6 are only actionable if the challenger pleads and proves a predicate violation of Sections 2, 3, 4, 5, or 7. That is plain from reading Section 9(D)(3) alone. But it is even more obvious when the language of Section 9(D)(3) is the only reason the Constitution affords a judicial remedy for four year maps at all.

## CONCLUSION

The Court should not read Section 8(C)(1) as an absolute barrier to judicial relief against a four-year map. But it should dismiss all three complaints here because they fail to plead and prove a predicate violation of Section 2, 3, 4, 5, or 7 (or, in the case of one set of Relators, invoke plainly inapplicable parts of the Bill of Rights).

Respectfully submitted,  
OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

*/s/ Bridget C. Coontz*

---

BRIDGET C. COONTZ (0072919)

*Counsel of Record*

JULIE M. PFEIFFER (0069762)

MICHAEL A. WALTON (0092201)

Assistant Attorneys General

MICHAEL J. HENDERSHOT (0081842)

Deputy Solicitor

Constitutional Offices Section

30 E. Broad Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Tel: 614-466-2872 | Fax: 614-728-7592

Bridget.Coontz@OhioAGO.gov

Julie.Pfeiffer@OhioAGO.gov

Michael.Walton@OhioAGO.gov

Michael.Hendershot@OhioAGO.gov

*Counsel for Respondents Ohio Governor DeWine, Ohio Secretary of State LaRose, and Ohio Auditor Faber*

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on December 17, 2021, the foregoing *Supplemental Brief Of Governor Mike DeWine, Secretary Of State Frank LaRose, And Auditor Keith Faber* was filed electronically. I further certify that a copy of the foregoing has been served via the electronic mail upon the following counsel for Relators.

### *Counsel for Relators*

FREDA J. LEVENSON (0045916)  
ACLU of Ohio Foundation, Inc.  
flevenson@acluohio.org

DAVID J. CAREY (0088787)  
ACLU of Ohio Foundation, Inc.  
dcarey@acluohio.org

ALORA THOMAS\*  
KELSEY MILLER\*  
JULIE A. EBENSTEIN\*  
American Civil Liberties Union  
125 Broad Street  
athomas@aclu.org  
jebenstein@aclu.org

ROBERT D. FRAM (PHV-25414)  
DONALD BROWN\*  
JOSHUA GONZÁLEZ (PHV-25424)  
JULIANA GOLDRÖSEN (PHV-25193)  
DAVID DENUYL (PHV-25452)  
rfram@cov.com

LAURA B BENDER (PHV-25192)  
MEGAN KEENAN (PHV-25410)  
ALEXANDER THOMSON (PHV-25462)  
bbender@cov.com  
mkeenan@cov.com  
athomson@cov.com

YIYE FU (PHV-25419)  
JAMES HOVARD (PHV-25420)  
ANUPAM SHARMA (PHV-25418)  
yfu@cov.com  
jhovard@cov.com  
asharma@cov.com

MADISON ARENT  
marent@cov.co

DONALD J. MCTIGUE\* (0022849)  
DEREK S. CLINGER (0092075)  
dmctigue@electionlawgroup.com  
dclinger@electionlawgroup.com

ABHA KHANNA (PHV-2189)  
WILLIAM B. STAFFORD (PHV-25433)  
Elias Law Group  
akhanna@elias.law  
bstafford@elias.law

ARIA C. BRANCH (PHV-25435)  
JYOTI JASRASARIA (PHV-25401)  
SPENCER W. KLEIN (PHV-25432)  
abbranch@elias.law  
jjasrasaria@elias.law  
sklein@elias.law

*Counsel for Relators*

PETER M. ELLIS (0070264)

*Counsel of Record*

M. PATRICK YINGLING

(PHV 10145-2021)

NATALIE R. SALAZAR

pellis@reedsmith.com

BEN R. FLIEGEL (PHV 25411-2021)

Reed Smith LLP

bfliegel@reedsmith.com

BRAD A. FUNARI (PHV 3139-2021)

DANIELLE L. STEWART (0084086)

bfunari@reedsmith.com

dstewart@reedsmith.com

BRIAN A. SUTHERLAND

(PHV 25406-2021)

Reed Smith LLP

bsutherland@reedsmith.co

*Counsel For Amicus Curiae Campaign  
Legal Center*

STEVEN S. KAUFMAN (0016662)

DOLORES P. GARCIA PRIGNITZ  
(0085644)

SARA S. DORLAND (0095682)

Ulmer & Berne

skaufman@ulmer.com

dgarcia@ulmer.com

sdorland@ulmer.com

ROBERT N. WEINER

(PHV 25521 pending)

CHRISTOPHER LAMAR

(PHV 25519 pending)

VALENCIA RICHARDSON

(PHV 25517 pending)

Campaign Legal Center

rweiner@campaignlegalcenter.org

clamar@campaignlegalcenter.org

vrichardson@campaignlegalcenter.org

*Counsel For Amicus Curiae City Of  
Cincinnati*

EMILY SMART WOERNER, (0089349)

Deputy City Solicitor

SHANNON PRICE (100744)

Assistant City Solicitor

emily.woerner@cincinnati-oh.gov

shannon.price@cincinnati-oh.gov

*Counsel For Amicus Curiae We Are  
Ohio*

JOHN M. HASELEY (0063042)

haseley@goconnorlaw.com

*Counsel For Amicus Curiae Ohio State  
Conference Of The NAACP*

*\*Not admitted to Ohio Bar*

SUBODH CHANDRA (0069233)

DONALD SCREEN (0044070)

subodh.chandra@chandralaw.com

donald.screen@chandralaw.com

JANETTE MCCARTHY WALLACE  
(0066257)

ANTHONY P. ASHTON\*

ANNA KATHRYN BARNES\*

NAACP

jlouard@naacpnet.org

aashton@naacpnet.org

abarnes@naacpnet.org

JON GREENBAUM\*

EZRA ROSENBERG\*

POOJA CHAUDHURI\*

Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights  
Under Law

jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org

erosenberg@lawyerscommittee.org

pchaudhuri@lawyerscommittee.org

*Counsel For League of Women Voters*

FREDA J. LEVENSON (0045916)

ACLU of Ohio Foundation, Inc.

flevenson@acluohio.org

DAVID J. CAREY (0088787)

ACLU of Ohio Foundation, Inc.

dcarey@acluohio.org

*Counsel For Respondents Senate Presi-  
dent Matt Huffman And House Speaker  
Robert Cupp*

PHILLIP J. STRACH (PHV-25444)

THOMAS A. FARR (PHV-25461)

JOHN E. BRANCH, III (PHV-25460)

ALYSSA M. RIGGINS (PHV-25441)

GREG MCGUIRE (PHV-25483)

Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough  
LLP

phil.strach@nelsonmullins.com

tom.farr@nelsonmullins.com

john.branch@nelsonmullins.com

alyssa.riggins@nelsonmullins.com

greg.mcguire@nelsonmullins.com

W. STUART DORNETTE (0002955)

BETH A. BRYAN (0082076)

PHILIP D. WILLIAMSON (0097174)

Taft Stettinus & Hollister LLP

dornette@taftlaw.com

bryan@taftlaw.com

pwilliamson@taftlaw.com

*Counsel For Amicus Curiae David  
Niven, Ph.D.*

STEPHANIE M. CHMIEL (0087555)

Counsel of Record

MARY E. CSARNY (0097682)

Thompson Hine LLP

Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com

Mary.Csarny@ThompsonHine.com

*Counsel For Respondent Ohio Redistricting Commission Special Counsel To Attorney General Dave Yost*

ERIK J. CLARK (0078732)  
ASHLEY MERINO (0096853)  
Organ Law LLP  
1330 Dublin Road  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
ejclark@organlegal.com  
amerino@organlegal.com

*Counsel For Respondents Senator Vernon Sykes And House Minority Leader Emilia Sykes*

JOHN GILLIGAN (0024542)  
DIANE MENASHE (0070305)  
John.Gilligan@icemiller.com  
Diane.Menashe@icemiller.com

/s/ Bridget C. Coontz  
BRIDGET C. COONTZ (0072919)  
Assistant Attorney



